

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 356 459

CS 011 271

AUTHOR Johns, Jerry; And Others
TITLE Whole Language in the Elementary School. Focused Access to Selected Topics (FAST) Bib No. 67.
INSTITUTION ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading and Communication Skills, Bloomington, IN.
SPONS AGENCY Office of Educational Research and Improvement (ED), Washington, DC.
PUB DATE [93]
CONTRACT RI88062001
NOTE 5p.
AVAILABLE FROM ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading and Communication Skills, Indiana University, Smith Research Center, Suite 150, 2805 E. Tenth Street, Bloomington, IN 47408-2698.
PUB TYPE Information Analyses - ERIC Clearinghouse Products (071) -- Reference Materials - Bibliographies (131)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Annotated Bibliographies; Elementary Education; High Risk Students; Instructional Effectiveness; *Reading Research; Teacher Role; *Whole Language Approach; *Writing Research

ABSTRACT

After defining whole language as a philosophy of literacy instruction based on the concept that students need to experience language as an integrated whole, this ERIC "FAST Bib" presents an annotated list of 35 ERIC documents and journal articles consisting of critiques of and responses to the whole language approach in the elementary school. The materials, which were published between 1988 and 1992, are divided into six sections: (1) Overview; (2) Critiques; (3) Recent Research; (4) Elementary Applications; (5) Applications to Special Populations; and (6) Teachers' Roles. Some related publications are also cited at the end of the document. (RS)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ERIC

Clearinghouse on Reading
and Communication Skills

Focused Access to Selected Topics
FAST Bib No. 67

WHOLE LANGUAGE IN THE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

by Jerry Johns, Cheryl Coseglia, and Peggy VanLeirsburg

Whole language is a philosophy of literacy instruction, based on the concept that students need to experience language as an integrated whole. This philosophy focuses on the need for an integrated approach to language arts instruction within a context that is meaningful for students. This *FAST Bib* presents a number of critiques of and responses to the whole language approach. Six sections are included: (1) overview; (2) critiques; (3) recent research; (4) elementary applications; (5) applications to special populations; and (6) teachers' roles.

Two types of citations are provided in this bibliography: ERIC documents and journal articles.

Citations of ERIC Documents

These citations are followed by an ED number. Full-text copies of these titles may be obtained from ERIC microfiche collections located at over 800 libraries around the world. Alternatively, you may order copies of the document from the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS) at the following address:

EDRS
7420 Fullerton Road
Springfield, VA 22153-2852
(800) 443-ERIC (3742) or
(703) 440-1400

Citations of journal articles

Full text copies of these journal articles are not available through ERIC microfiche collection or from EDRS. Articles are most economically obtained from library collections. Articles from some journals are available through University Microfilms International at (800) 732-0616 or through Original Article Tearsheet Service at (800) 523-1850.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document
do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy.

Overview

Burchby, Marcia. "Literature and Whole Language," *New Advocate*, v1 n2 p114-23 Spr 1988.

Summarizes some of the criticisms which have been directed at basal instruction. Discusses how whole language approaches enhance the ability to teach students to read and engage them in a democratic and democratizing educational experience.

Gursky, Daniel. "After the Reign of Dick and Jane," *Teacher Magazine*, v2 n9 p22-29 Aug 1991.

Examines the philosophy of the whole language approach to teaching and learning. Stresses that language should remain whole and uncontrived, that children should use it in ways that relate to their own lives, and that finding correct answers is not as important as learning processes.

Pace, Glennellen. "When Teachers Use Literature for Literacy Instruction: Ways That Constrain, Ways That Free," *Language Arts*, v68 n1 p12-25 Jan 1991.

Identifies key premises from whole language theory relative to language and language acquisition, reading and writing processes, teaching and learning, and curriculum. Discusses questions and underlying principles using classroom events.

"Why Whole Language?" *Instructor*, v99 n9 p46-49 May 1990.

Presents comments by several reading experts on the whole language approach to teaching reading and on the whole language debate. Includes definitions of whole language, characteristics, justifications, shortcomings, and critiques.

Critiques

Ford, Michael. "Whole Language Change: Lessons from Hostile Audiences," *Journal of the Wisconsin State Reading Association*, v35 n1 p29-35 Win 1991.

Answers the five following common objections to the whole language approach: Haven't we tried this all before? What will happen to the child if some teachers use whole language and others don't? Where does the teacher

find the time to do all this? Where's the proof that it works? and What about the future?

Moorman, Gary B. and others. "The Rhetoric of Whole Language: Part One," *Reading Psychology*, v13 n2 piii-xv Apr 1992.

Presents the explicit assumptions structuring the whole language movement using 18 articles cited in the ERIC database. Attempts to accurately portray the whole language position in terms of definitions of whole language and statements about reading/writing behavior and instruction.

Moorman, Gary B. and others. "The Rhetoric of Whole Language: Part Two," *Reading Psychology*, v13 n3 piii-xv Jul 1992.

Uncovers and presents the implicit assumptions of whole language, the beliefs that lie beneath the arguments, and perhaps beneath the level of conscious awareness of those who make the arguments. Uses the figurative language in whole language writings as the basis for an interpretive and critical method called deconstruction. Expresses concern that the rhetoric of whole language may block the process of thoughtful, substantive change.

Thompson, Richard A. "A Critical Perspective on Whole Language," *Reading Psychology*, v13 n2 p131-155 Apr 1991.

Attempts to appraise the whole language instructional philosophy in relation to what is known about reading methodology. States that this critical perspective is catalytic.

Zarrillo, James. "Theory Becomes Practice: Aesthetic Teaching with Literature," *New Advocate*, v4 n4 p221-34 Fall 1991.

Asserts that there is a gap between theory and practice in literature-based reading programs. States that such programs often lack an underlying theory and mimic methodology associated with basal programs.

Recent Research

Antonelli, Judith. "Decoding Abilities of Elementary Students Receiving Rule-Based Instruction and Whole Language Instruction," 1991. 30p. [ED 331 002]

Reviews a study which investigated the decoding automaticity of elementary students when receiving rule-based instruction (as a process of applying syllable and structural analysis rules and limited phonics) and when receiving holistic instruction in a whole language program (exercises in listening, reading, and writing, integrated with classroom instruction when possible).

Edelsky, Carole. "Whose Agenda Is This Anyway? A Response to McKenna, Robinson, and Miller," *The Educational Researcher*, v19 n8 p7-11 Nov 1990.

Disputes the version of whole language presented by Michael McKenna, et al., in an earlier article. Argues that whole language is an educational paradigm complete with theoretical, philosophical, and political assumptions and a congruent research agenda. Contends the "paradigm blindness" prevents critics from seeing the legitimacy of whole language-generated research.

Klesius, Janell P. "A Whole Language and Tradition Comparison: Overall Effectiveness of the Alphabetic Principle," *Reading Research Quarterly*, v30 n2 p47-61 Win 1991.

Examines the differences in the effect of language and traditional instruction in end-of-year reading, writing, and spelling achievement with varying levels of incoming phonemic reading, and writing ability.

Kucer, Stephen B. "Authenticity as the Basis for Language Arts," v68 n7 p532-40 Nov 1991

Reports on research that investigated conditions of the purpose of certain whole language lessons. Concludes that, even in whole language, authenticity may be missing. Helps educators deeply about what literacy lessons should be and how instruction can help develop literacy strategies while maintaining the integrity of the process.

Lehman, Barbara A. and others. "Teacher Perceptions and Practices for Using Children's Literature in Reading Instruction." Paper presented at the 1991 meeting of the National Reading Conference, Dec 1991. 329-937]

Examines three questions regarding: (1) teachers' views about the role of children's literature in the reading program; (2) how teachers implement literature-based reading programs in their classrooms; and (3) the difference between teacher perceptions and teacher practices in literature-based reading instruction.

McGee, Lea M. and Lomax, Richard G. "On Apples and Oranges: A Response to Stahl and Miller," *Review of Educational Research*, v60 n1 p1-11 Mar 1990.

Offers criticism of a research study by Stahl and Miller which compared the effectiveness of whole language/language experience programs versus basal approaches to teaching reading.

Shaw, Patricia A. "A Selected Review of Research on Whole Language," *Journal of the Wisconsin State Reading Association*, v35 n1 p3-17 Win 1991.

Identifies quantitative research on pre-reading, literature and basal approaches to teaching first-grade children, whole language and traditional approaches to beginning reading, students' achievement in whole language and older students, and in basal. Concludes that whole language may be in an earlier stage of reading development.

Schickedanz, Judith A. "The Jury is Still Out on Whole Language and Language Experience for Beginning Reading: A Critique of Stahl and Miller Study," *Review of Educational Research*, v60 n1 p1-11 Mar 1990.

Criticizes the study by Stahl and Miller for lack of longitudinal data, alternative interpretation of data concerning the broad goals of whole language approaches.

Elementary Applications

Huebsch, Winnie R. "Utilizing Tradebooks in the Elementary School: Considerations and Implications for Change." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Reading Association, 1991. 10p. [ED 334 559]

Reviews changes made in a Milwaukee, Wisconsin district of the reading program, based on a philosophy that spoken, read, and written language must flow naturally from the child, be used in meaningful ways to communicate real need, and involve tradebooks. Discusses challenges which remain involving distribution of tradebooks, financial constraints, and developing methods of assessment consistent with the principles of whole language. Provides a list of the tradebooks used in the district and a tradebook evaluation guide.

Jett-Simpson, Mary. "Organizing the Whole Language Reading Class: Readers' Workshop and Focused Study Reading Workshop," *Journal of the Wisconsin State Reading Association*, v35 n1 p49-55 Win 1991.

Describes the Readers' Workshop and the Focused Study Reading Workshop. Offers them as a way to accommodate the characteristics of individuals, to respect the knowledge of readers who are at earlier stages of reading development, to establish a system which teaches problem solving, and to provide for active child involvement and ownership in the reading program.

Larrick, Nancy. "Give Us Books!...But Also... Give Us Wings! (Concepts and Themes)," *New Advocate*, v4 n2 p77-83 Spr 1991.

Discusses problems associated with literature-based reading programs which use children's literature in the same way basal readers are used. Encourages teachers to allow students the freedom of exploring and learning from books without creating drill and vocabulary lessons from them.

Linek, Wayne M. "Grading and Evaluation Techniques for Whole Language Teachers," *Language Arts*, v68 n2 p125-32 Feb 1991.

Identifies the need to resolve inconsistencies between the whole language teaching approach and school, district, or state grading and evaluation policies.

Midvidy, Nancy. "Teaching Beyond the Basal Program," *Reading: Exploration and Discovery*, v13 n1 p19-26 Fall 1990.

Provides examples of how holistic procedures can be implemented by teachers who want to supplement the required basal. Demonstrates how student's reading ability, language acquisition, and communication skills can be strengthened as teachers activate prior knowledge, provide language-rich environments, consider reading/writing connections, and focus on thinking.

Miller, James G. and others. "Whole Language--Inside and Outside!" *Pathways to Outdoor Communication*, v1 n1 p14-15 Fall 1991.

Describes a teacher's efforts to create an anthology of poems written by fourth grade-students. Includes whole language activities progressing from poetry reading and

group writing to individual writings based on outdoor themes.

Rabin, Annette T. "Selecting Literature for the Whole Language Classroom: What Factors Should We Consider?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Reading Association, 1991. 6p. [ED 334 553]

Identifies factors which whole language teachers view as important to the readability of the literature they select: print size, illustrations, repetition, vocabulary, predictability, and interest.

Schroeder, LaVern. "Custom Tailoring in Whole Language Evaluation," *Journal of the Wisconsin State Reading Association*, v34 n4 p45-55 Fall 1990.

Clarifies the term "emergent literacy" and reviews significant informal assessment techniques, record-keeping systems, and reporting measures appropriate for emergent literacy. Discusses guidelines for whole language assessment and outlines steps to follow in developing local assessment measures.

Stanek, Lou Willett. "Whole Language for Whole Kids: An Approach for Using Literature in the Classroom," *School Library Journal*, v37 n9 p187-89 Sep 1991.

Discusses the use of literature in the whole language approach. Describes the integration of a second grader's experiences with the curriculum, integrating the language arts in the middle school via study of the author as well as the book, and the integration of literature into the study of history.

Applications to Special Populations

Allen, JoBeth and others. "'I'm Really Worried About Joseph': Reducing the Risks of Literacy Learning," *The Reading Teacher*, v44 n7 p458-72 Mar 1991.

Shares the findings of three classroom teachers and a university professor from their collaborative study of how whole language instruction affects the students that teachers worry about most.

Calfee, Robert. "Schoolwide Programs To Improve Literacy Instruction for Students at Risk." 1991. 33p. [ED 338 726]

Argues that a reformulation of reading and writing in the elementary grades can integrate the following three buzzwords of American education: (1) students at-risk for school failure; (2) the whole language movement; and (3) restructuring. Describes a schoolwide approach to the literate use of language, beginning with anecdotal accounts of two correlated programs, Project READ and the Inquiring School.

Gersten, Russell and Dimino, Joseph. "Visions and Revisions: A Perspective on the Whole Language Controversy." Version of a paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Reading Conference, 1990. 24p. [ED 329 913]

Contrasts philosophies of optimal reading instruction held by special and general education, which appear to be in stark conflict. Discusses approaches based on the work of cognitive psychologists that can be integrated into either direct instruction or whole language frameworks to address some of the nagging concerns about each of the

two models. Suggests that educators consider seriously the issues and criticisms raised by whole language authors.

Johns, Jerry L. "Helping Readers at Risk: Beyond Whole Language, Whole Word, and Phonics," *Journal of Reading and Writing*, v7 n1 p59-67 Jan-Mar 1991.

Describes five generalizations for reading instruction with disabled and normal readers: (1) caring, positive relationship between teacher and student; (2) the role of re-reading and daily reading; (3) appropriate materials; (4) interest as a springboard to learning; and (5) the unification of instruction.

Teachers' Roles

Koepke, Mary. "The Power to Be a Professional," *Teacher Magazine*, v2 n9 p35-41 Aug 1991.

Describes experiences of a fifth-grade teacher who converted her classroom into a whole language classroom. Emphasizes student empowerment and decision making, cooperative learning, and flexibility.

Martin, Rodney D. "Empowering Teachers to Break the Basal Habit." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the International Reading Association, 1991. 7p. [ED 334 568]

Discusses events between the late sixties and the eighties which were major influences in empowering Australian reading teachers to break the basal habit. Explains reasons why teachers were so willing to break away from dependence on basal texts including the empowerment of teachers through political acceptance of alternatives, training, a grass roots movement, and cooperative effort.

Monson, Robert J. and Pahl, Michele M. "Charting a New Course with Whole Language," *Educational Leadership*, v48 n6 p51-53 Mar 1991.

Enlarges the phonics/whole language debate by focusing on the classroom teacher's evolving role. Suggests a complex paradigm shift is needed from teacher's transmission of knowledge to students' transaction or engagement with constructing meaning.

Sumara, Dennis; Walker, Laurie. "The Teacher's Role in Whole Language," *Language Arts*, v68 n4 p276-85 Apr 1991.

Searches for some precision in the discourse of whole language with respect to the role of the teacher as expressed in words such as empowerment, control, predictability, and authenticity. Observes and interprets the practice of two successful whole language teachers to refine understandings of these concepts as they are enacted in classrooms.

Winners, Diane; Cassidy, Judith K. "Teaching Reading and Writing in a Whole Language Atmosphere: The Teacher's Role," *Ohio Reading Teacher*, v24 n4 p14-17 Sum 1990.

Discusses the whole language teacher's role in the development of children's writing and creating a positive writing environment in the classroom.

Related ERIC/RCS Publications:

New Policy Guidelines for Reading: Connecting Research and Practice, by Jerome C. Harste—\$9.95.

Peer Teaching and Collaborative Learning in the Language Arts, by Elizabeth McAllister—\$15.95

TRIED Series (Teaching Resources In the ERIC Database)

Each volume contains about 40 classroom-ready, tried-and-tested learning strategies designed by teachers for teachers.

Reading Strategies for the Primary Grades—\$14.95

Remedial Reading for Elementary Students—\$14.95

Celebrate Literacy: The Joy of Reading and Writing—\$14.95

ERIC/RCS Special Collections

Each Special Collection contains an assortment of at least 10 topic-related ERIC/RCS Digests and FAST Bibs.

Special Collection 13: *Whole Language and Integrated Language Arts* - \$7.95.

To receive these publications, to order a customized ERIC search, or to receive an ERIC catalogue, please call 1-800-759-4723.

ERIC Clearinghouse on Reading
and Communication Skills
Indiana University
Smith Research Center, Suite 150
2805 East Tenth Street
Bloomington, IN 47408-2698
(812) 855-5847; (800) 759-4723
FAX (812) 855-4220
March 1993

This publication was prepared with partial funding from the Office of Educational Research and Improvement, U.S. Department of Education, under contract no. R188062001. Contractors undertaking such projects under government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their judgment in professional and technical matters. Points of view or opinions, however, do not necessarily represent the official view of the Office of Educational Research and Improvement.